

# Potential movement of mountain vegetation zones in Scotland under predicted climatic change

A thesis presented for the degree of Master of Philosophy  
at the University of Aberdeen  
in the year 2005

Keith Iain McKay (*Kim*) Harding, BSc (Edinburgh)

January 2005

## **Declaration**

I declare that this thesis has been composed by my self. It has not been accepted in any previous application for a degree, the work of which this is a record has been done by myself, any personal data have been processed in accordance with the provisions of the Data Protection Act 1998, and all direct quotations have been distinguished by quotation marks and the sources of information specifically acknowledged.

## Acknowledgements

Funding: Macaulay Development Trust

Supervisors: Profs. Steve Albon (Macaulay Institute) and David Robinson (The University of Aberdeen), without their help, support and constructive suggestions, I could not have written this thesis.

Access and permission: Simon Winton of Dalmunzie Estate, Invercauld Estates, National Trust for Scotland, and Scottish Natural Heritage

Roger Cummins and Jim Small (Macaulay Institute) for advice on seed trapping, Richard Hewison (Macaulay Institute) for his advice on identifying seedlings, Douglas McKean (RBGE) for his advice on identifying seeds, David Elston and Betty Duff (BioSS) for their invaluable advice on the statistics, David Riley (Macaulay Institute) for the seedling and studio photographs, Gordon Ewen (Macaulay Institute) for setting up and repairing the logger (I had never seen a greeny go green before), also Graham Gaskin and Davie Sim (Macaulay Institute) of technical services for their help. Thanks to Helen and Jess at Hartwood (Macaulay Institute) for advice on sorting out the Husky, and to Allan Sim for running the growth room. I would also like to thank all the people I scrounged equipment off.

I would like to thank my parents for their love, support and understanding.

Nick, Bente (we must finish that paper sometime), Sander, Vera, Sue, Caitlin, Emma, and Ulli for assisting with the field work or at least coming along for the ride. My thanks go to Steve Halliday (Dalmunzie Estate) for towing the landrover out of the ford, also to Fergus ('Heidi'), Dave ('The Beast of Braemar') and Pete of Braemar Mountain Sports for all the tea, and the Hungry Highlander for providing all the venison burgers. Special thanks go to Ann for keeping me sane and stopping me from giving up and to Pete Goddard for his support during a difficult time. Grateful thanks to Ulli for all the proof reading and putting up with me when things were rough. To my fellow students for all their entertainment and nights in the pub, names are not given to protect the guilty, but they know who they are...

Dr Andrea Britton (Macaulay Institute) for helping with setting up the project and helping with the plant survey, Dr Sarah Woodin (The University of Aberdeen) and Dr Rob Brooker (Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, Banchory) for helping with setting up the project.

## Abstract

The global climate has shown an increase of 0.6°C over the last century and a further rise of between 1.5°C and 5.8°C is predicted over the next century. It is expected that ecosystems at high altitudes and latitudes will be particularly sensitive to climatic change. European studies have shown an upward movement of plant species, which has been attributed to climate change. Given the lack of suitable historical surveys to investigate the potential changes in Scottish mountain vegetation due to global climate change over the past century, a different approach was needed.

A two pronged approach was taken: Firstly, it was necessary to collect information on the potential for seed to move from lower vegetation zones to higher levels under predicted climate change. Secondly, it was necessary to determine if an increase in mean temperature, as predicted by the climatic models, would affect the strength of interactions between plants.

In order to investigate the dispersal potential of mountain species, a study was designed to measure seed rain at a number of points along several altitudinal transects in the Grampian Mountains in Scotland, and soil cores were taken to measure the seed bank present. A survey of current vegetation was also carried out at the sites along the altitudinal transects.

Open Top Chambers were used, to simulate the effects of predicted climate change, to test whether this would alter the balance between competition and facilitation in arctic/alpine plant communities. The experiment was set up at 1000 m a.s.l. in the Scottish Highlands, using *Carex bigelowii* and *Alchemilla alpina* as target plants. The target plants were transplanted into replicate environmental treatments. Within each environmental treatment, the target plants were planted with and without neighbours. Measurements were taken of final above ground biomass, as well as environmental variables.

No evidence was found for a significant upward movement of seed. *Calluna* seed has been found in the seedbank at higher altitudes than the surface vegetation. However this is unlikely to lead to *Calluna* colonising the alpine zone under the currently predicted levels of climate change. While the size of the *Calluna* seedbank has not changed significantly from previous studies, the level of *Calluna* seed rain does appear to be declining. The results of the experiment on the balance between competition and facilitation were inconclusive. Unfortunately it was also not possible to determine the relative importance of temperature and wind as an ecological factor in the Scottish alpine zone.

In conclusion mountain vegetation zones in Scotland will not move as whole, but there may be migrations of individual plant species. These migrations could have unexpected consequences and may be in directions different to expectation. Changes in zonation of plant communities are unlikely to be driven by temperature alone, however the currently employed modelling approaches are not sensitive to other factors. There is a need for more field data to understand how climate change will affect the distribution of alpine arctic vegetation, before more reliable models can be developed.

# Contents

Declaration.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	iii
Abstract.....	iv
Contents .....	v
Lists of Figures.....	vii
List of Tables.....	ix
Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
1.1. Background: Evidence for climatic shifts in mountain vegetation .....	1
Scotland.....	4
1.2. Vegetation zonation in the Scottish mountains.....	7
1.3. Description of climate in the Scottish Highlands.....	9
1.4. Climate change .....	10
1.4.1. Global climate change .....	10
1.4.2. Predicted climate change scenarios for Scotland .....	11
1.5. Approach, hypotheses and thesis plan.....	15
1.5.1. Hypotheses.....	16
1.5.2. Brief outline of experimental approach – layout structure .....	16
References.....	18
Chapter 2: Potential for plants to move in a changing climate – A study of mountain vegetation and seed dispersal.....	23
2.1. Introduction.....	23
2.1.1. Seed dispersal .....	24
2.1.2. Seed banks.....	27
2.1.3. Seed trapping .....	28
2.1.4. Aims.....	29
2.2. Methods.....	30
2.2.1. Study sites .....	30
2.2.2. Layout of study .....	32
2.2.3. Vegetation surveys .....	33
2.2.4. Seed trapping .....	35
2.2.5. Seed identification.....	36
2.2.6. Seed bank.....	36
2.2.7. Statistical Analysis and Data Handling.....	39
2.3. Results .....	40
2.3.1. Vegetation survey .....	40
2.3.2. Seed trapping .....	42
2.3.3. Seed bank.....	45
2.3.4. Analysis relating current seed rain (seed trapping) to historic seed rain (seed bank).....	48
2.4. Discussion.....	52
2.4.1. Potential for plants to move – upward shift in vegetation?.....	52
2.4.2. Factors influencing vegetation under climate change .....	56
2.4.3. Influences other than climate change .....	58

2.4.4. Uncertainties.....	58
2.5. Conclusions.....	59
References.....	59
Chapter 3: Effects of environmental manipulation of local climate on plant interaction.....	68
3.1. Introduction.....	69
3.1.1. Competition and facilitation.....	69
3.1.2. Environmental manipulation - warming experiments.....	70
3.1.3. Target plant species.....	71
3.1.4. Aims.....	71
3.2. Methods.....	71
3.2.1 Site Description.....	71
3.2.2. Experimental design.....	72
3.2.3. Growth of target plants.....	77
3.2.4. Environmental monitoring.....	78
3.2.5. Analysis methods.....	80
3.3. Results.....	81
3.3.1. Plant biomass.....	81
3.3.2. Environmental variables.....	83
3.4. Discussion.....	96
3.5. Conclusions.....	99
References.....	100
Chapter 4: Discussion.....	105
4.1. Potential changes in community structure due to migration and changes in competition under climate change.....	105
4.2. The broader context.....	106
4.3. Possible improvements to work carried out and recommendations for further research.....	107
4.4. Implications of habitat conservation and management.....	111
4.5. Conclusions.....	111
References.....	112
Appendix 1: Botanical Surveys of the four sites.....	114
Glas Maol.....	114
Beinn a' Bhuid.....	117
Derry Cairngorm.....	119
Glas Tulaichean.....	121

## Lists of Figures

Figure 1.1: The altitudinal ranges of Scottish vegetation zones.....	8
Figure 1.2. Conrad's index of continentality.....	6
Figure 1.3. Reconstructed and recorded past temperatures.....	11
Figure 1.4. Predicted changes in daily mean temperatures for Scotland.....	13
Figure 1.5. Predicted changes in precipitation for Scotland.....	14
Figure 1.6. Predicted changes in average winter snowfall for Scotland.....	14
Figure 2.1a. Locations of seed trapping stations on Mar Lodge Estate.....	31
Figure 2.1b. Locations of seed trapping stations on Glas Tulaichean.....	31
Figure 2.1c. Locations of seed trapping stations on Glas Maol.....	31
Figure 2.2. A graphical representation of vegetation types.....	33
Figure 2.3. Layout of 4 x 4 m quadrat used for the vegetation survey.....	34
Figure 2.4. Pitfall seed trap.....	36
Figure 2.5. Trays containing soil cores collected for the seedbank trial.....	38
Figure 2.6. <i>Calluna</i> seedlings.....	38
Figure 2.7. Seed tray containing a soil core.....	39
Figure 2.8. <i>Carex</i> seedling in seed tray.....	39
Figure 2.9. Number of <i>Calluna</i> seeds collected.....	50
Figure 2.10 Density ( $n\ m^{-2}$ ) of <i>Calluna</i> seed and seedlings.....	51
Figure 3.1. Map of the location of the Glas Tulaichean site.....	72
Figure 3.2. One replicate block consisting of OTC, wind shelter and control.. .....	73
Figure 3.3. Schematics for building a hexagon chamber.....	74
Figure 3.4. Plot design showing planting positions within an OTC.....	75
Figure 3.5. Example of a <i>C. bigelowii</i> plant with two tillers and a new tiller shoot showing on the young tiller.....	76
Figure 3.6. A modified Windtronic 2 anemometer as used to measure wind speed at ground level within the environmental treatments.....	78
Fig 3.7a. Comparison of the mean dry weights of the above ground parts of <i>Alchemilla alpina</i> under the three different environmental treatments ..	82
Fig 3.7b. Comparison of the mean dry weights of the above ground parts of <i>Carex bigelowii</i> under the three different environmental treatments.....	82
Figure 3.8. Comparison of the mean hourly wind speeds at 1m above ground and mean wind speeds recorded at the ground level inwith the three environmental treatments.....	84

Figure 3.9. Wind rose showing the frequency of wind directions recorded between 12th May and 28th July 2004 .....	84
Figure 3.10. Mean air temperatures recorded in the with-neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control environmental treatments .....	86
Figure 3.11. Mean soil temperatures recorded in the with-neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control environmental treatments .....	88
Figure 3.12. Mean soil temperatures recorded in the without neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control environmental treatments .....	90
Figure 3.13. Mean air temperatures recorded in the with-neighbours treatments within the Shelter and Control environmental treatments....	92
Figure 3.14. Mean soil moisture in the three environmental treatments.....	93
Figure 3.15 Mean PAR levels recorded in the with-neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control environmental treatments .....	95



## List of Tables

Table 2.1. Locations of the seed trapping stations at the four sites .....	32
Table 2.2. Estimated percentage <i>Calluna</i> cover recorded at each seed trapping station. ....	41
Table 2.3a. The diversity and evenness of vascular plant species found at 50m altitudinal intervals at all four sites shown using a Simpson's diversity index (1- <i>D</i> ) and Simpson's measure of evenness ( $E_{1-D}$ ).....	41
Table 2.3b. Analysis of the effects of altitude on diversity and evenness, showing the results of the ANOVA.....	42
Table 2.4. Seeds collected in the seed traps between November/December 2002 and August 2004 at the trapping stations along altitudinal transects at the four different sites.....	43
Table 2.5. Percentage of vascular plant species present in the surface vegetation which are represented in the seed rain from both years at all four sites. ....	45
Table 2.6. Seedlings germinated from soil cores collected along altitudinal transects at the four different sites.....	47
Table 2.7. Estimated seedbank densities for <i>C. bigelowii</i> (seedlings per m <sup>2</sup> ) at the four sites. ....	48
Table 2.8. Percentage of vascular plant species present in the surface vegetation which are represented in the seedbank, by seedling emergence, at all four sites.....	48
Table 2.9. Plant species which were not recorded in the vegetation survey for the site but were recorded in either the seed traps or the seedbank ....	49
Table 2.10. Plant species which were recorded in the vegetation survey for the site (transect) but not at the individual seed trapping station where they were recorded in either the seed traps or the seedbank .....	49
Table 2.11. Interannual variation in <i>Calluna</i> seed rain at the four sites, collected during 2003 and 2004, representing seed production during 2002 and 2003.....	52
Table 2.13. Regional mean maximum and mean minimum temperatures, and mean rain fall for the summers (Jun – Aug) of 2002 and 2003 for the East of Scotland.....	58
Table 3.1. With and without neighbour treatments applied to the two target species planted into the different environmental treatments.....	75
Table 3.2. Results of an ANOVA of the mean dry weights of the above ground parts of plants grown with or without-neighbours in three different environmental treatments .....	83
Table 3.3. Mean difference in temperatures recorded hourly in the environmental treatments between 12th May and 28th July 2004 .....	85

Table 3.4. The results of the regression analysis of the mean air temperatures in the with-neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control treatments.....	87
Table 3.5. The results of the regression analysis of the mean soil temperatures in the with-neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control treatments.....	89
Table 3.6. The results of the regression analysis of the mean soil temperatures in the without neighbours treatments within the OTC and Control treatments.....	91
Table 3.7. The results of the regression analysis of the mean air temperatures within the Shelter and Control treatments.....	93
Table 3.8 Results of ANOVA showing the differences in soil moisture between treatments.....	94
Table 3.9. The results of the regression analysis of mean PAR.....	96

*As I did stand my watch upon  
the hill,  
I look'd toward Birnam, and anon,  
methought,  
The wood began to move.*

Macbeth, Act 5, Scene 5